Metadata through a DEI Lens: Creating More Inclusive Cataloging in the MARC Environment

Christina Manzella & Rich Murray, Duke University Libraries
Inclusive Description Task Group

- Document current practices
- Identify gaps and opportunities
- Identify remediation projects
- Identify alternative vocabularies and thesauri
- Identify issues that are tangential but outside the scope of the Task Group
- Make recommendations
## Gender in Personal Name Authorities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rec stat</th>
<th>a</th>
<th>c</th>
<th>97940552</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Type</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>19971205</td>
<td>Repld 20140618025816.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>b</td>
<td>Sârim, Abdussamed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auth</td>
<td>b</td>
<td>H; b; c; d; e; f; g; h; i; j; k; l; m; n; o; p; q; r; s; t; u; v; w; x; y; z</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geo subd</td>
<td>b</td>
<td>'Abduşsamad Şârim</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Notes:**
- Machine-derived non-Latin script reference project.
- Non-Latin script reference not evaluated.
- His târîh-i insâni kâ sab se ... 1997: 'Abduşsamad Şârim Alâzharî tâ. verî (Prof. 'Abduşsamad Şârim Alâzharî) LC data base. 12-05-97 (kdg. Şârim, 'Abduşsamad).
## Gender in Personal Name Authorities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>编号</th>
<th>说明</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>040</td>
<td>DLC + b eng + e rda + c DLC + d DLC + d WaU + d InU + d WaU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>045</td>
<td>#f 1969-03-04 + # e df</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td>1 Bono, Chaz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>368</td>
<td># c Americans + c Californians + c Icdqt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>370</td>
<td>Los Angeles (Calif) + c United States + e Los Angeles (Calif) + 2 naf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>372</td>
<td>Gender nonconformity + 2 Iosh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>373</td>
<td>Gay &amp; Lesbian Alliance Against Defamation + 2 naf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>375</td>
<td>Transgender man</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>375</td>
<td>Transgender people + 2 Icdqt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>375</td>
<td>Females + 2 Icdqt + a 1969 + t 2008?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>375</td>
<td>Males + 2 Icdqt + a 2008?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>377</td>
<td>eng</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>378</td>
<td># q Chaz Salvatore</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>1 Bono, Chaz Salvatore</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>1 Bono, Chastity Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>1 Bono, Chastity Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>670</td>
<td>Family outing. 1998. + b CIP t.p. (Chastity Bono) pub. info. (Entertainment Media dir. of GLAAD; staff writer for Advocate)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>670</td>
<td>Transition. 2010. + b ECIP t.p. (Chaz Bono)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>570</td>
<td>Wikipedia. February 14, 2011 + b (Chaz Bono: Chaz Salvatore Bono (born Chastity Sun Bono; March 4, 1969); American transgender advocate, writer, actor, and musician; female-to-male transgender man; around age 39, Bono underwent female-to-male gender transition. A two-part Entertainment Tonight feature in June 2009 explained that Bono’s transition had started a year before; Bono legally changed gender and name in May 2010; born Los Angeles, California; residence: Los Angeles, California)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Accessibility for Non-English Speakers
Current Remapped LCSH

# Specifies remappings for problematic LCSH
# Headings to remap must be specified at the whole subdivision level.
# Only entire subfield values are replaced. For example:
# $aPoor$eMedical care $dPoor people $dMedical care
# BUT:
# $aPoor children$eMedical care DOES NOT GET REMAPPED
# This requires some repetition here in the mappings, but it is clearer and safer

aliens: "Noncitizens"

alien detention centers: "Immigrant detention centers"

child slaves: "Enslaved children"

children of illegal aliens: "Children of undocumented immigrants"


#dirty war remapping commented out, according to Cory at Duke, only topical subdivisions are allowed in remappings. TRPLN discovery will discuss adding geographic, etc. to allow

freemen: "Freed people"

fugitive slaves: "Fugitive enslaved persons"

hideous subdivision: "Better subdivision"

illegal alien children: "Undocumented immigrant children"

illegal aliens: "Undocumented immigrants"

illegal aliens in literature: "Undocumented immigrants in literature"

Indian slaves: "Enslaved indigenous peoples"

Source: https://github.com/trln/marc-to-argot/blob/master/lib/translation_maps/shared/subject_heading_remappings.yaml
More about this project: https://trln.org/activities/working-groups/shared-discovery-services-working-group/metadata-team/
Remapped LCSH in our Discovery Layer

Performing citizenship: undocumented migrants in the United States

Mary McThomas.
McThomas, Mary, author.
Book / Print.

Where to find it

PERKINS & BOSTOCK LIBRARY — STACKS
Available
Request

Related subjects

- Undocumented immigrants > Government policy > United States
- Undocumented immigrants > Education (Higher) > United States
- Drivers' licenses > United States > States
- Citizenship > Political aspects > United States
- Undocumented immigrants > Government policy > United States
- United States
Making Alternative Thesauri Work for You, Your Collections, & Your Users

• LCSH isn’t great for every subject area—as we all know, there are some notable gaps in its coverage

• SACO is a way to fill those gaps, but it’s slow and time-consuming (but still worth doing)

• Fortunately...there are a lot of alternative thesauri out there are already available for use in MARC cataloging
Introduction
Subject Source Codes
Subject Source Code Usage in MARC and MODS/MADS

Introduction

*Subject Sources* identifies subject heading lists, thesauri, and databases that are the sources of topical, geographic, chronological, and other headings or terms used as resource, and assigns a code to each source. The purpose of this list is to identify the vocabulary used in records, or code assignment, general structure, usage, and for Vocabularies, Rules, and Schemes.

These sources are general subject heading and thesauri, such as the *Library of Congress Subject Headings*, along with a number of focused subject *Headings or Getty Thesaurus of Geographic Names*. Additional specialized lists are provided with source codes in

- Genre/Form Term and Code Source Codes
- Occupation Term Source Codes
- Function Term Source Codes
- Temporal Term Source Codes

Since general thesauri often contain a broad spectrum of terms, including genre, forms, occupations, functions, and time periods, the source codes metadata elements identified for each of the specialized source lists. Likewise, the special thesauri listed there may also be used in the metadata elements identified below under usage.

Some subject heading lists incorporate names and titles and others employ independent name and title lists for parts of a subject heading. Thus the and Title Source Codes may also be used in the metadata elements identified below under usage.
dtict
Defense Technical Information Center thesaurus (Fort Belvoir, VA: DTIC)
dugfr
Dugas, Jean-Yves. Dictionnaire universel des gentilés en français (Montréal, Québec: Linguatech éditeur Inc.)
ebfem
Encabezamientos bilingües de la Fundación Educativa Ana G. Mendez (Puerto Rico: Fundación Educativa Ana G. Mendez)
eclas
ECLAS thesaurus (Luxembourg: European Communities, Office for Official Publications)
eet
European education thesaurus
eflch
E4Libraries Category Headings
eks
Eduskunnan kirjaston asiasanaasto (Helsinki: Eduskunnan kirasto)
embiaecd
Encabezamientos de materia de la Biblioteca Islámica de la Biblioteca AECID (Madrid: AECID)
embne
Encabezamientos de materia de la Biblioteca Nacional de España (Madrid: Biblioteca Nacional de España)
embucm
Encabezamientos de materia, normativa para su redacción (Madrid: Universidad Complutense de Madrid)
embuz
Encabezamientos de materia de la Biblioteca de la Universidad de Zaragoza (Zaragoza: Universidad de Zaragoza)
emnmmus
Emneord for musikkdokument i EDB-kataloger (Norwegian Directorate for Public and School Libraries)
et
LGBTQ topics in LCSH

• Coverage can be ... spotty

• Some terms are stilted (“Sexual minorities”), while a lot of topics are just not there at all

• Sometimes it takes a combination of several LCSH to convey a single idea, which isn’t ideal for clickability
Homosaurus to the Rescue!

Homosaurus.org
Homosaurus

- LGBTQ homeless people
- LGBTQ homeless youth
- LGBTQ hotels
- LGBTQ immigration rights
- LGBTQ imprisonment
- LGBTQ incest victims
- LGBTQ indigenous people
- LGBTQ Internet forums
- LGBTQ intimacy
- LGBTQ Inuit
- LGBTQ Jehovah's Witnesses
- LGBTQ Judaism

- Chakka
- Changing rooms
- Characters (LGBTQ)
- Chatrooms
- Chest harnesses
- Child custody
- Children
- Children (LGBTQ)
- Children of bisexual people
- Children of gay men
- Children of lesbians
- Children of LGBTQ people
- Children of queer people
- Children of transgender people
- Children's sexuality
- Chosen name
Using Homosaurus in MARC records

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Field</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Gay men $z$ Canada $v$ Biography.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Racism $z$ Canada.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Cree Indians $v$ Biography.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>651</td>
<td>Driftpile Cree Nation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>LGBTQ indigenous people. $u$2 homoit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Sexual minorities. $2$ fast $0$ (OCoLC)fst01202158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Cree Indians. $2$ fast $0$ (OCoLC)fst00882643</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Welcome to the Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies

AIATSIS acknowledges all Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Traditional Custodians of Country and recognises their continuing connecting to land, sea, culture and community. We pay our respects to Elders past and present.
Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies (AIATSIS) Thesauri

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Aboriginal Australians ≡z Australia ≡z Cape York Peninsula (Qld.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Aboriginal Australians ≡x Kinship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Kinship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Aboriginal Australians ≡x Social structure ≡z Cape York Peninsula, Queensland.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Social structure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>651</td>
<td>Australian Institute of Aboriginal Studies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Ganganda people (Y138) (Qld SD54-12) ≡2 aiatsisl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Gugu Yau people (Y22) (Qld SD54-04) ≡2 aiatsisl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Kaanju / Kaantiu language (Y44) (Qld SD54-08) ≡2 aiatsisl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Tjungundji people (Y14) (Qld SD54-03) ≡2 aiatsisl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Umpila people (Y45) (Qld SD54-08) ≡2 aiatsisl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Wik Elken people (Y49) (Qld SD54-07) ≡2 aiatsisl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Wik Mungkan people (Y57) (Qld SD54-07) ≡2 aiatsisl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Wik Ngatharr people (Y51) (Qld SD54-07) ≡2 aiatsisl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Wuthathi people (Y10) (Qld SC54-16) ≡2 aiatsisl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>Yir Yoront people (Y72) (Qld SD54-15) ≡2 aiatsisl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>651</td>
<td>Mitchell River (Qld Gulf, NW Cape York SD54-15, SD54-16, SE54-06, SE55-01) ≡2 aiatsisl</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
N15: Emmi

AIATSIS code: N15
AIATSIS reference name: Emmi

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Links</th>
<th>Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thesaurus heading</td>
<td>Emmi language N15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thesaurus heading</td>
<td>Emmi people N15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Synonyms: Emmi/Merranunggu, Warrgat, Arnhem Land, Daly River Region Languages, Ami, Maranunggu, Amijangal, Emmiyangal, Manthli Yangal, Maranjwarrgat, Menthha, Merranunggu, Ami Ami, Ame, Berringin, Western Daly language.
Realities of using alternative thesauri

• We can’t use all of them (nor would we want to)—start with one or two and use them strategically
• Not every newly cataloged book is going to get them
• Original catalogers may add them to books that are passing across their desks, but often copy cataloging/shelf-ready won’t get that opportunity (can we encourage vendors?)
• Legacy metadata: is “retrospective Homosaurification” viable?
• But we have to start somewhere: Is “Well, we can’t have them on everything” a reason not to do it at all?
Flexing the *Subject Headings Manual* & LCSH

- Limitations and frustrations don’t just originate from LCSH itself—sometimes catalogers feel constrained by the *Subject Headings Manual*...and sometimes it’s a joint effort between LCSH and SHM

- Sometimes you have to bend the rules, especially to provide more inclusive description...

- ...so let’s use comic book cataloging as an example of how to think about it
The Edwin & Terry Murray Comic Book Collection at Duke University

• Approximately 55,000 comic books from the 1930s to the early 2000s

• Almost everything published by major publishers such as Marvel, DC, Dark Horse, Image, etc. plus scattered coverage of other large publishers (e.g., Disney) and lots of underground comix

• Originally described at the box level in finding aids, in 2016 we decided to catalog it at the title and item level
Why are comic books significant to DEI?

• Perhaps more than any other medium regularly collected by libraries, comic books reflect the world around them with immediacy.

• Comic book characters grow and change over decades (Wonder Woman turns 80 this year!) and tracing their evolution—as well as how they view their environment & how their environment views them—is very telling, especially for characters in historically marginalized groups.

• Comics have often been on the forefront of introducing members of underrepresented groups into their universes.

• In recent years, comics & graphic novels have become a low-barrier entry point for writers & artists of color, LGBTQ creators, women, people with disabilities, immigrants, etc. to tell their stories.
The Problem: SHM tells you not to catalog comics*

• From H 1430: Comics and Comic Characters

• “It is subject cataloging policy to assign a genre/form term to selections from a comic strip or single-panel cartoon, and to graphic novels; headings to bring out their subject content are assigned only in limited circumstances, as described below. Subject headings are routinely assigned only to works about such strips or cartoons, or about graphic novels.”

• “Limited circumstances” = biographical fiction, historical fiction, and animal stories

*This is an exaggeration, but not by much
And the double whammy:

• “Do not assign headings for characters to fictional works featuring the character.”

• Examples from SHM:
  • Title: Wonder Woman annual.
    • 655 #0 $a Comic books, strips, etc.
  • Title: The white lama.
    • [original work complete in six volumes]
    • 655 #0 $a Graphic novels.
Harley Quinn got her own self-titled comic book in 2000. LC didn’t follow the SHM—they did add some subject headings to their record—but what LCSH did they add?

- Batman (Fictitious character)--Comic books, strips, etc.
- Joker (Fictitious character)--Comic books, strips, etc.
LCSH’s “defaults”

• The characters who are included as subject headings fall into what Sanford Berman describes as...

• “parochial, jingoistic Europeans and North Americans, white-hued, at least nominally Christian (and preferably Protestant) in faith, comfortably situated in the middle- and higher-income brackets, largely domiciled in suburbia, fundamentally loyal to the Established Order, and heavily imbued with the transcendent, incomparable glory of Western civilization.”

How do we steer around these cataloging potholes?

• Ignore H 1430* (*this is an exaggeration, but not by much)
• Assign fictitious character headings to comics starring those characters
• Assign class of persons headings generously
• Assign topical headings thoughtfully
• Be especially diligent when cataloging works featuring women, people of color, LGBTQ people, people with disabilities
Such as….

- Women superheroes—Comic books, strips, etc.
- African American men—Comic books, strips, etc.
- Asian American teenagers—Comic books, strips, etc.
- Transgender people—Comic books, strips, etc.
- Mississippi—Race relations—Comic books, strips, etc.
But remember....

• Women superheroes—Comic books, strips, etc.
• ALSO Superheroes—Comic books, strips, etc.

• Not doing so suggests that “Superheroes” are men but that “Women superheroes” are women—we want that “Superheroes—Comic books, strips, etc.” link to retrieve ALL the records about ALL the superheroes
Contact info

Christina Manzella – christina.manzella@duke.edu
Rich Murray – r.murray@duke.edu